

**ARAB FAMILIES WORKING GROUP  
CORE GROUP MEETING  
CAIRO, FEBRUARY 21-22, 2003  
WORKSHOP REPORT**

**Attendees:** Annelies Moors, Barbara Ibrahim, Hania Sholkamy, Ibrahim Elnur, Jihad Makhoul, Mona Khalaf, Mishka Mourani, Nadine Naber, Naila Sabra, Penny Johnson, Ray Jureidini, Suad Joseph, Zeina Zaatari, Abdel Ghaffar M. Ahmed.

**Research Assistants:** Rania Salem, Nahla Zarroug

**A. Suad Joseph Coordinator's Report**

I would first like to introduce Dr. Abdel Ghaffar M. Ahmed for being with us today. Dr. Abdel Ghaffar is the new Director of MEAwards, Population Council, Cairo.

**1. AFWG Membership**

Dr. Soraya Altorki has put her Core Group membership on hold in order to focus her research on Saudi Arabia.

Hoda Rashad has put her Core Group membership on hold because she has been contracted to do a research project for the National Council on Women.

Huda Zurayk was a member of the Well-being Research Project Group (not at Core Group member). She can not commit to collaborative research or writing at this time because of her work schedule. She said she could stay on an observer to the dialogue but when Core Group members were consulted it was agreed by that Core Group and RPG members must be working members.

Dina Craissati withdrew from the group and has moved with UNICEF to West Africa.

Omnia El Shakry has accepted our invitation to join the Core Group. She is a member of the Public Discourse Research Project Group and will attend the next Core Group meeting in June.

Malak Zaalouk has attended parts of many of our meetings but has not been actively working. We need to follow up with her about her status.

Lina Abou-Habib was invited to be in the Core Group at the founding of AFWG. She has not attended any AFWG meeting. She had wanted to alternate with Mishka Mourani who has graciously attended most meetings of the Core Group and the Public Discourse RPG. Mishka, however, pointed out that she is not a researcher and cannot fulfill the research requirements of Core Group or RPG membership. I agreed to follow up with Lina and Mishka. [After the meeting, I spoke with Lina who agreed that she would participate in the Public Discourse Research Project Group in place of Mishka who will withdraw].

## **2. Protocol Revision: Authorship**

It was agreed that the clause “*single authored articles produced by AFWG members are welcome in collaborative works produced by AFWG, such as edited volumes, special journal editions.*” be added to the AFWG Protocols.

## **3. Funding**

### **IDRC Ottawa**

I met with Pamela Sholbey of IDRC, Ottawa in Casablanca in July 2002. I sent to her the Concept Paper developed in the September 2002 Cairo Public Discourse meeting. IDRC in Ottawa program officers are very interested in our project. They were waiting for the Cairo office to review it, but apparently, it fell between the cracks in the Cairo office, with the change in program officers. Ottawa said that funding may be possible in the next year cycle. They were especially interested in the Youth and Border Crossings research projects. They also indicated that funding for us will be a high priority if there is any money unused in this cycle.

They may be able to fund between 200,000 - 300,000 Canadian dollars, which is about 130,000-260,000 US Dollars but they cannot promise anything at this point. We should hear about the funding later in Spring.

## **4. Ford Foundation**

Barbara Ibrahim and I met with Sharry Lapp and Maha El Adaway of Ford Foundation, Cairo. They were interested in our research but they do not have the money at this point due to a recent market crisis. They said that they would put us on their agenda for the next cycle. This means we need a proposal by middle of April. The proposal needs to include products for the public, such as the webpage etc. Funders are asking about the products we will share with the public.

## **5. Current Funds**

The IDRC funds that we have ends in June 2003, which leaves us with only the Population Council funds which expire in December 2003. We have a meeting set up for June, which will be covered by the Population Council fund. This will leave us with US \$20,000-30,000, which we could use for research. During the course of this meeting we will need to discuss what we will open to public access, as well as the operationalization of our research.

## **6. Goals**

Our goals for this meeting are to:

1. Operationalize research
2. Plan a product for the end of 2003
3. Plan a publication for the end of 2004
4. Plan fund-raising
5. Decide on products to be made available to the public
6. Policy implications of our research

7. Need to begin integrating NGO and government agencies

## **Research Project Group Presentations**

### **I. Public Discourse Research Project Group**

#### **Presenter Martina Rieker**

I will first summarize the key issues that we came up with in our concept paper.

We realized that we had a vast project that had historical and contemporary components, so we decided that it would be best to look at certain points of crisis for the family. We all decided that youth was a good place to start because it is the center of crisis in the family and is a phase of transition, transformation, and identification crisis for the family.

There were various questions asked as the stages of research,

1. Is there a crisis of youth? What is to be done about it? [The lost generation]
2. What is the ideal family as represented in Nation-State projects?
3. What are the implicit public discourses represented in the controversies over normative sexualities?

We also want to look at how youth are represented statistically and demographically.

Three sites were identified as sites of research,

1. Law and Public Policy
2. Media
3. Education

These three sites will be researched for the three countries we are concentrating on, Egypt, Lebanon, and Palestine.

We also discussed the products we want to produce.

1. We thought of creating a bibliographic archive on the web.
2. We also want to do a survey of existing data sets and surveys. We will look at why these data sets have been done? How the research was done? As well as a critical analysis of their outcomes.

#### **Presenter Barbara Ibrahim**

I would like to go over some of the issues that we debated.

1. Justification for choosing youth.
  - a. Since the family is our focus, we asked ourselves how it changes. One change is when one generation moves out and sets up a family of their own when they get married.
  - b. The idea that many new ideas enter society through the young for example, normative sexuality.
  - c. Youth are a majority of our society

2. What are the discourses found in,
  - a. public discourse
  - b. lived realities
  - c. theory
3. What is the ideal family? And how is it shaped by the State?

There seems to be good integration with the Well-being and Border Crossings Research project groups.

**Presenter Penny Johnson**

I believe that we need to bring in such concepts as gender and age. In the media discourse, when youth is discussed it is usually male youth. Rami Khoury and Tom Friedman have been researching the crisis of youth. Friedman has published a series of volumes on the crisis of youth, but he only talks about male youth. So this discourse is very gendered and we need to develop this further in our concept paper. I think that using an age lens is also useful. I feel that the Palestinian component needs to be developed more. I want to work on the valorization of youth and the tensions in families who are trying to protect their youth. Even while the youth are being valorized they are also being damaged.

**Discussion**

**Suad Joseph**

In Lebanon the youth were not valorized during the war. I believe this is because the war was not valorized. So a resistant movement is different from a civil war.

**Penny Johnson**

I think we need to look at youth within a historical context for example, youth in the 1860's.

**Nadine Naber**

We should also look at the colonizer's representations of youth, where they are seen as terrorists etc., as well as how they are represented in nationalist discourses.

**Barbara Ibrahim**

As a group we cannot look at all these discourses. I suggest we keep to nationalist discourses.

**Penny Johnson**

If there is a global perspective, I think it needs to be incorporated in our research.

**Zeina Zaatari**

I believe we should look at the international news agencies within the national sphere because they become part of the local discourses.

**Martina Rieker**

This is a region of intensive migrant labor, so we need to remember that Egypt, Palestine, and Lebanon are not segregated from each other.

**Mishka Mourani**

With regards to Lebanon, they don't know what their recent past was let alone that of the 1860's, so there is a question of memory. The Syrian occupation is blamed by part of the population, but not all of it, for these crises. I think it is better to look at State policy for example, the lowering of the voting age from 21 to 18.

**Zeina Zaatari**

To use the term "occupation" will complicate things because it seems to be political. I would suggest we use the term Syrian "pressures." There are many discourses on Syrian pressures, as well as Palestinian pressures and if they have undermined the Lebanese society.

Also, in saying there is a crisis of youth, whose perspective are we looking from? Do youth feel they are in crisis? We need to keep this in mind.

**Mona Khalaf**

I would like to point out that it is not only Lebanese youth that were affected by the Syrian and Palestinian presence, but the whole society. The reason it is usually associated with youth is because they are the ones who express this issue more.

**Mishka Mourani**

When I think about it there are two lost generations,

1. The generation of 40's and 50's, who lost the national project
2. The new generation of youth who are dissatisfied with their situation

Concerning foreign domestic workers, I do not believe it is a youth issue. These workers are doing the work that these youth will not do.

**Zeina Zaatari**

I would have to disagree with you on the domestic workers issue. There is another aspect of the effect of domestic workers, and that is their effect on the children in the houses they work in.

I also think that they will do domestic work.

**Ray Jureidini**

There is another issue that has not been looked at and that is the replacement of Arab domestic workers with foreign maids. This even affected sexuality. For example, in the past the Lebanese male youth's first sexual experience often were with the Arab maid. I would not think the situation is the same now with foreign maids. This raises an interesting issue that needs to be looked at further.

**Barbara Ibrahim**

I think we need to step back and look at more general issues such as the impact of foreign influence within a society and not at specific issues such as the Syrians, Palestinians etc.

**Naila Sabra**

I think we should look at public and private schools and the organization of the curricula in Lebanon. We should also look at the segregation of schools in Lebanon.

**Penny Johnson**

I am concerned when we get into youth as a subject, that the subject gets too broad. The link between youth in public discourse and the lived experiences of youth needs to be looked at. We have to keep the lens of the family when looking at youth so we do not get lost in such a large project.

**Zeina Zaatari**

I think it is hard to define the category of youth. Will we be going as far back as 1918, World War II, or are we looking at current youth?

**Penny Johnson**

We might choose certain critical moments in time to categorize youth, but we will first need to pinpoint these moments in history.

**Martina Rieker**

I would like to revisit history and the point of 1860. We need to look at how the past enables us to look at how the category of youth developed in history to get us to the modern concept of youth. I think it is very important to historicize its historical presence. Youth as a category emerges at a certain historical moment which is launched by the national project.

There is also a gendered aspect of youth that we need to be aware of, example “Shabab.”

**Suad Joseph**

Historicizing the concept of youth will take a long time. I think we need to take youth and family in the concept of State process.

**Penny Johnson**

This links to how we look at the family and youth in the construct of different notions of modernity. I think we are thinking of using historicity and not actually going to archives.

**Barbara Ibrahim**

Mona was challenging us to define youth. We will need to contextualize the definition of youth in certain situations, but this definition has to be kept flexible because the concept of youth differs between and within countries.

**Abdel Ghaffar Ahmed**

I believe that the selection of youth as a category is a good idea. I feel that you are saying that there is one Arab family. This needs to be contextualized.

**Suad Joseph**

Yes, we do realize this and have taken it into consideration. You can see that in naming the group we called it the Arab Families Working Group, so as to point out there is more than one Arab family. I would like to go back to Zeina’s point about if youth see they are in crisis.

Through my research in Lebanon, I feel that youth do feel they are in crisis because there was a sense of what they had lost due to the war, such as education, economic choices, jobs etc. They talk about themselves as lost.

### **Jihad Makhoul**

There are different youth categories in Lebanon. These differences can be found between men and women in urban settings, and even within youth in urban settings. You will also find that development agencies have different definitions for youth. I think that this is a project by itself, “what is youth?”

### **Mona Khalaf**

In the Lebanese American University, I noticed that just after the war all students wanted to do was to live fully. They were not concerned with working hard at their education or even in having successful careers. As a result of this we have a lot of students who are on drugs, and many young teenagers stay out late as a norm. Parents seem to feel guilty about the time their children lost due to the war and this seems to be the reason for their laxity in discipline. Parents just want to give their children all the freedom and material things that they want.

### **Zeina Zaatari**

I believe that there are two categories of who is lost. One is the youth who have lost direction and orientation of their lives because of the war. The other are the parents of youth, whose children see them as a lost generation because of the failure of the democratic process during their time. Parents are also blamed for the war. There are also many forms of loss. There is loss of life, loss of direction, loss of political power, loss of discipline etc. We need to define what we mean by lost and loss.

### **Barbara Ibrahim**

Parent’s failure can also be seen as a failure of modernity.

### **Ray Jureidini**

One graduate student has done a study on Lebanese youth and the internet. These youth log on to chat rooms and communicate with people from all over the world. It will be interesting to see what they discuss.

### **Naila Sabra**

The United Nations is interested in HIV and AIDS awareness. There is little awareness of Aids in Lebanon even though there is promiscuity linked to drugs.

### **Penny Johnson**

We are integrating the concepts of youth, modernities, family, and public. But where is the public platform where the discourses are taking place? For example, in Palestine, the discourse attacking the Palestinian Authority is not a public discourse, it is implicit in taxis etc. We must define what is public. Also, the discourse about Palestinian youth martyring themselves is a discourse brought by Israel. Our discourse is a discourse of resistance.

**Suad Joseph**

This is a link to the Border Crossings research, where the site of the public/private is flexible. So we need to ask the questions, when does a discourse become public? and, when does a family issue become public?

**Ray Jureidini**

We could have both formal and informal discourse. The formal discourse is what we find discussed in the media. The informal discourse is what we find in taxi cabs etc., but which is still a public discourse.

**Penny Johnson**

We still have to problematize this further.

**Suad Joseph**

Yes, problematizing what is public is important because the same site could be public in one place and private in another.

**Jihad Makhoul**

Going back to the point about youth. We should not presume that “Shabab” means “youth.” The meaning of youth differs between urban and rural areas. The term youth could also have a power context because “Shabab” are those men who bring in the money to support the family. These men could be 40 years old. Then there are those who are 20 years old who are also referred to as “Shabab.” We also have to problematize the “other” who are always seen as the source of “our” problems. Rarely do people blame themselves or their families for their problems. We need to look at the Arabic and English meanings of terms. In Arabic “Shabab” can convey power, but the English translation does not.

**Ibrahim Elnur**

I feel that the term “lost generation” is very confusing in usage and term. There is the older generation who lost the National project, and there is also the younger generation who lost something else, hope, jobs, feasible marriage, and no national project. So I would agree with Zeina that there are two lost generations.

**Rania Salem**

In the life cycle one must realize that there is the assumption of what youth should achieve in their lives. When these assumed goals are not achieved, the youth assume that they have failed. We also assume that they must accomplish these certain goals, or they are said to be in crisis. Does failure happen as a discreet event or is it a process?

**Barbara Ibrahim**

I would say that everything is judged in terms of that failure.

**Suad Joseph**

We need to historicize what is expected of youth at specific times.

**Annelies Moors**

The proposal seems to sit on two different levels,

1. Theoretical
2. Mid-level types of statements

We need to keep it about youth and the family. We need to specify the age and generation we are talking about. We need to specify what is public. Some of the statements made in the concept paper need to be researched further. Would it not be better to be more explicit about general notions?

**Suad Joseph**

Having made the first pass on the concept paper we can now work on it more.

**Nadine Naber**

Farha Ghanam presented a paper on youth in Egypt at the AAA meeting. It would be interesting to look at it. We need to distinguish between official and unofficial discourses. We should look at what youth say about themselves and what they say are the discourses about them. In my dissertation research I noticed that in interviews, patterns emerged on what Arab girls wanted to become and what was expected by their families. Maybe we can look for similar patterns.

**Barbara Ibrahim**

It would be interesting to bring in Farha Ghanam's work when we talk about sexuality.

**Mona Khalaf**

The issue of displaced youth is relevant to both Palestine and Lebanon.

**Zeina Zaatari**

Concerning internet chatting, there is the issue of mental displacement as well as physical displacement. Through chatting these youth are voicing their dissatisfaction with their cousins abroad.

**Martina Rieker**

It could be useful to think conceptually and see what moment in time we want to look at. Displacement due to labor migration has been going on for a while now. Do we want to look at one, two, or all aspects of displacement? Poverty is one aspect of displacement in Egypt that I want to look at.

**Mona Khalaf**

War also causes rural-urban displacement.

**Annelies Moors**

We have to look at what forms of mobility, and immobility we are studying, as well as what that means in a place where there is mobility. For example, domestic workers who then become immobile and locked in the home of their employers.

## **II. Border Crossings Research Project Group**

### **Presenter Ray Jureidini**

I will explain the focus of our research.

We are looking at family disruptions and change caused by either forced or voluntary migration.

The project is interested in key shifts of gender with in:

1. Division of labor - domestic division of labor
2. Formation of fictive and non-fictive family relations (kinship)
3. Negotiation of survival and coping strategies at a familial level
  - economical
  - financial
  - emotional
  - religious etc.

Our research sites are:

1. Domestic workers in Lebanon - Ray Jureidini
2. Displaced communities in Lebanon - Jihad Makhoul
3. Palestinian Refugees in Palestine - Eileen Kuttub
4. Sudanese Refugees in Egypt - Ibrahim Elnur
5. Arab families in the United States - Nadine Naber

### **Presenter Nadine Naber**

The project is building on feminist critiques on public/private distinctions. We are looking at issues of the blurriness of the public/private, the changes in the public/private, and what is the ideal public/private in the diasporic context. The family becomes the key site in shifts in diasporic functions.

The issues are focused on three themes:

1. Division of labor
  - We will look at how women are forced to find ways to generate an income for the family when displaced.
2. Notions of fictive kinship
  - This is based on the notion that when a family is faced with financial problems it creates non-biological fictive relations. We want to see how this emerges, not only as a process of economic survival, but also as a way to maintain cultural and social identity. We will also be looking at how the family is essential in the formation of national and cultural identity.
3. Negotiation of survival and coping strategies at a familial level
  - We will be looking at the blurriness of the public/private divide when faced with diasporic conditions. We will also look at:
    - a. Marriage patterns
      - Those who marry from back home so as to maintain cultural identity
      - Those who marry a citizen of the host country to get citizenship

## b. Family size

We gave a historical context to our research to recent migration since the 1973 oil boom in the Gulf.

### **Presenter Ibrahim Elnur**

We had difficulty in getting common issues between our research, but we found the idea of population flows was a common theme. We will be looking at:

1. Arab families that are moving
2. Arab families that are left at home
3. Arab families in the host country

We also incorporated decision-making in the division of labor.

### **Presenter Jihad Makhoul**

We are taking border crossings to mean crossing

1. National borders
2. Borders within nation-states, within community, or within family.

## **Discussion**

### **Annelies Moors**

With regards to the division of labor, are you going to look at how family members become family, and how people define what it the family?

### **Nadine Naber**

We will have to define this for our research sites.

### **Ray Jureidini**

There are cases of very organized migration found in Lebanon, where you can find a whole community adopting a 20 year plan of migration, in which one member of the family after another migrate to one area.

### **Annelies Moors**

So you may want to use terms like translocal and transnational families. Translocal families ties in with globalization. It becomes possible to keep family ties in different sites, moving back and forth through the circulation of people and goods. This is especially relevant to domestic workers who have left children in their home country. Translocal is more useful than transnational because transnational implies the crossing of national borders.

### **Nadine Naber**

We could raise transnational and translocal terms in our proposal because they will be different in each of our research sites.

**Ray Jureidini**

We could also include the notion of household.

**Barbara Ibrahim**

The terms nuclear and extended families talks about household living arrangements, it does not take into account mobility.

**Zeina Zaatari**

There is a lot of literature about transnational mothering, especially on Latino and Filipino domestic workers in the United States. Chains of care is another topic studied.

**Ray Jureidini**

This has a class dimension to it.

**Annelies Moors**

This takes gender a lot further than men-women relations, because it looks at the relations between women and the hierarchies found there. An interesting question to raise is if Arab domestic workers are considered fictive kin or not.

**Ray Jureidini**

Also, part of this discourse is if these domestic workers want to become part of the family or not. There are times when they do not want to get involved with the family they are working with.

**Mona Khalaf**

I would suggest that the term household should not be used because it has an economic context [people living in the same house]. The use of the term family would be better. What do you mean by division of labor? Are you looking at income generating activities as a variable? Do you see that there are new work activities developing? This overlaps with the Well-being research.

**Ray Jureidini**

With displacement there has been a change of individual activities. With regards to income generating activities, we will be looking at both wage and non-wage work. For division of labor, we will only be looking at how it is affected by displacement.

**Jihad Makhoul**

We are looking at the division of labor needs, not only with regards to work, but also the gender segregation of work within the household under conditions of displacement, war, violence and migration. Displacement also affects issues such as the age people are sent out to work, whether boys or girls are sent out to work, age of marriage, and who initiates marriage.

**Hania Sholkamy**

How are you defining displacement? Are you looking at a time frame, generation etc.?

**Nadine Naber**

We are taking displacement as:

1. Labor movement
2. Forced migration
3. Displacement due to development projects

**Ray Jureidini**

Yes, we need to narrow down displacement into a possible workable project. I think this will be done when we come to operationalizing the project.

**Hania Sholkamy**

Other than the dimension of time there is the dimension of the homeland and whether it is intact or in diaspora. For example, in Egypt we have people moving to the Gulf and but their homeland is intact, whereas the Palestinians have been forced to move from their homeland which has been destroyed.

**Mishka Mourani**

There is the experience that connects Egypt and Lebanon and that is of the Shawan. These were Christian Lebanese and Syrians who moved to Egypt in the early 20<sup>th</sup> century, moved back to Lebanon in the 1860's, and then moved to Australia. This is a case of plural migration.

**Ray Jureidini**

We will be looking at the 1973 migration of Arabs to the Gulf during the oil boom, and who were later replaced by Asian workers after the Gulf war.

**Suad Joseph**

This migration to the Gulf and return from the Gulf has a political context, because Arab workers were forced to move due to government policies.

**Barbara Ibrahim**

I want to go back to fictive kin. I came across this during my earlier research on women working in factories in Egypt. I found that women would use the fictive term “uncle” with co-workers so as to make their work in the factory socially acceptable.

**Suad Joseph**

I think we should be careful when using the term “fictive kin” and not to assume that there is a such a thing as a “natural kin.” I would use the term “Idiomatic kin” rather than “fictive kin.”

**Jihad Makhoul**

In patron/client relations people use kin idioms to construct relations that would enable them to get services.

**Zeina Zaatari**

In Lebanon people would even change their last name to that of a powerful family, so as to get patron-client relationships.

**Suad Joseph**

What is it about the power of the family, or kinship that endures? Is it due to the failure of the state or modernity to provide protection or services?

**Martina Rieker**

These kinship idioms continue to reproduce kinship hierarchies in the new sites in the diaspora.

**Nadine Naber**

This is where we will look at issues of gender and gender hierarchies.

**Hania Sholkamy**

I am worried about the notion of crisis. Migration is not always bad. It is in forced migration that crisis comes up.

**Suad Joseph**

Language plays a game with us. We are talking about family as if it is the same everywhere.

**Hania Sholkamy**

Is there not a bond of blood or milk that is the basis of family?

**Ray Jureidini**

Family is a legally recognized unit everywhere.

**Martina Rieker**

The only way to get out of this is to take a certain time frame and look at family at a certain point in time. This could be the time of the nation-state, or the period of the Tanzimat. These questions are being raised recent in Indian literature.

I feel that we need to look at the definition of family in a historical perspective.

**Penny Johnson**

We are in a sort of theoretical model quest. There are also economic moments that we can look at, and not just political moments. It is not just about Arab families versus Western families, there are also exchanges and symbolic orders within the family. Going back to histories. The studies done on the family in the 1960's will be useful to look a however, there is a gap in the histories.

**Nadine Naber**

Maybe we can put these issues that have come up into our research question, so as to clarify that they are still questions and that we are not making assumptions about them.

**Martina Rieker**

I am interested in Annelies's translocal idiom, and also where these transnational families never experience the nation-state, especially the poor.

**Ray Jureidini**

This is true except in Lebanon, where the patron-client relationship is being replicated in the diaspora, so the people carry the same political relations over to their new home.

**Barbara Ibrahim**

We can raise the question of how people are manipulating the state in our research question.

**Ray Jureidini**

Now that the state no longer wants to take on the welfare provisions it had done in the past, the people are forced to depend on themselves or other agencies.

**Suad Joseph**

Yes, and there are places that have never had a state at all. This brings to mind nomadic people who would leave their area when the State tries to get involved with their lives.

**Zeina Zaatari**

The state still has authority over passports and laws.

**Suad Joseph**

We presume that the state affects the daily lives of people, but maybe we should ask this as a research question rather than presume it.

**Ray Jureidini**

Penny, you mentioned something about people moving for their children's education?

**Penny Johnson**

In Ramallah people are moving out for their children's educational welfare. Another interesting issue has developed concerning the internet. There are sites on the internet where one can ask Sheikhs questions about sharia family laws. These are known as cyber sheikhs. So we now have the case where family law moves across borders. It would be good to look at the informal applications of sharia through cyberspace: Cyber Mufti's; Cyber Islam; Cyber Sheikh's,

**Annelies Moors**

There has also been research on cyber mufti's in Europe.

**Martina Rieker**

The Nation is more complicated than the State project and we need to bring back the Nation and make sure we are referring to the one we mean. Families do not interact with the State, but individuals do.

**Hania Sholkamy**

It is theoretical that the unit of society is the family. The legal subject is always the individual.

**Zeina Zaatari**

But the individual is always a member of the family.

**Penny Johnson**

The constitutions of Jordan and Palestine do not say that the family is the unit of the society.

**Hania Sholkamy**

It will be more productive to look at labor laws to see the individual as a unit.

**Suad Joseph**

Do NGO and State laws view refugees and displaced peoples as individuals or families?

**Penny Johnson**

I would say they define them as families or family units.

**Hania Sholkamy**

Not all organizations have the same definition of family. For example, the UNHCR has faced problems on what constitutes family in African countries, especially in cases where one man is married to twelve women.

**Penny Johnson**

The right of return literature shows different definitions of family.

**Suad Joseph**

This is certainly a concern for the Border Crossings and Public Discourse Research Project Groups.

**Nadine Naber**

We are all challenging the idea that there is such a thing as an “Arab family.” The Border Crossings will look at families in motion, while the Public Discourse looks at the way discourse changes and varies from realities.

**Jihad Makhoul**

People become adolescent at different ages in different climates. In Sudan adolescence appears at 10 years, while in colder countries it could appear at 13.

**Hania Sholkamy**

There is the question of whether race produces different adolescents.

**Suad Joseph**

Race was seen as a climatic issue in the 19<sup>th</sup> century.

### **III. Well-being Research Project Group**

#### **Presenter Mona Khalaf**

I would first like to say that we lost both Hoda Rashad and Huda Zurayk due to their other work commitments. The topic was Women, Work and Family Well-being, but since Hoda Rashad and the SRC are working on this topic, we have decided to change it to Women, Men, and Youth Work and Family Well-being. We decided to include men, and instead of children we will look at youth, thus producing a link with the Public Discourse group. We have started with the premise that *“economic transformations have shaken the prevailing ideal of the male as the single breadwinner.”* Since the patriarchal bargain has been shaken, we will look at the new pacts that have developed. Both the patriarchal bargain and the term employment will need to be described. We will look at well-being not only in monetary terms but also as emotional well-being. We will also look at how wage labor has affected women’s leisure time.

By well-being of the family we will look at both the overall well-being of the family as well as the well-being of the individuals in the family. So we will use a macro approach at the level of the family, as well as a micro approach at the level of the individual. I feel we have links with both the Border Crossings and Public Discourse research project groups.

Links to other Research Project Groups:

1. Domestic division of labor - if there is a change in the division of labor in the family as a result of women’s work. Are Arab men taking up domestic work when women go out to work?
2. Public/private boundaries - Does women’s work change the boundaries of the family?
3. Youth - What is the impact of youth’s work on family well-being?

Some of the questions we will be looking at are:

1. Do women get empowered as a result of their work?
2. What do women do with their money? Statistics indicate that women keep a very small, if any, part of their income for themselves, unlike men who keep a larger amount.

We will be analyzing existing data sets in our research.

#### **Presenter Hania Sholkamy**

I would like to situate this in defining the two concepts essential to this project.

##### **1. Family**

At a certain point of time family was a functional unit. It has many forms and shapes but is still persistent in the society. Its functional dimension is material and economic in nature, and one part of this is the idea that the male is the single breadwinner in the family.

##### **2. Well-being**

We are interested in looking at the parameters of well-being in the family. We will use a life cycle approach in our research of the topic. At certain points the family well-being will be the focused on the individual, and at other points it will be focused on the family as a whole. We will look at employment and unemployment as material indicators and factors of well-being.

These parameters will be different in each research site, but the life cycle approach will be applied to all the sites. We will also do an analysis of employment opportunities for the three sites. The dichotomies that we will be problematizing will be family and individual.

**Presenter Naila Sabra**

There is the possession of physical assets such as, land, and material assets, that affect well-being. We may want to explore this because this is an alternate money generating factor, other than wage work, that will produce income and thus affect well-being.

**Discussion**

**Mona Khalaf**

This will be difficult to do. Income is easier to study because it is a regular flow of money, whereas wealth is unpredictable.

**Hania Sholkamy**

I think that when we look at employment we will need to look at assets, and a qualitative research approach will bring out assets. The point will be to connect all these processes that are involved in well-being. When we take family narratives over a long period of time many indicators will show up.

**Penny Johnson**

There is also the question of rising prices and the monetarization of people's lives.

**Barbara Ibrahim**

I was very interested in collective versus individual well-being, and not the well-being of the mother only. This is a subject that has not been looked at. I am also interested in the aspect of emotional well-being. Regarding the patriarchal bargain, this is where men provide economic goods in return for women's household, social and emotional provisions however, when women begin to earn an income with work it does not necessarily mean that they gain more power. Do you see a link with the Border Crossings group over this point?

**Ibrahim Elnur**

I see an increasing informalization of the economy, so we need to focus on the parameters which produce transformations in family dynamics, and I think we need to discuss these parameters especially since this issue seems to be an overlap with the Well-being and Border Crossings groups. I agree with Naila in that we need to look at other components of income such as wealth from assets.

**Mona Khalaf**

We can differentiate between income and wealth. If a family member sends \$100 every month then this can be looked at as income.

**Ibrahim Elnur**

I think that assets matter too and should be looked at.

**Barbara Ibrahim**

In the old bargain, a woman's assets were hers and she could choose to use them or not.

**Mona Khalaf**

Sometimes women do not want their family's wealth to leave their natal family. They would relinquish their inheritance to other family members, rather than have it go to their husbands' families.

**Abdul Ghaffar Ahmed**

The family is a functional unit and no matter what, it still remains a safety net for people. My idea is that in many cases, the extended family is an obstacle for development because it reduces the initiative of individuals. Burdens placed by the extended family reduce the resources available to the well-being of the nuclear family. So we have to look at when the family is a proper safety net and when it becomes a burden.

**Mona Khalaf**

It is true that the extended family does have problems but it also has many positive aspects for example, grandmothers will take care of children when the wife goes to work, and this helps in development. I feel that we are now suffering because we do not have an extended family.

**Annelies Moors**

I am still not clear about the parameters of well-being. Who defines that parameters of well-being? Do we define them, or do we ask families how they define well-being?

**Mona Khalaf**

Victor Fuchs has produced some parameters of well-being.

**Annelies Moors**

I think you will need to include the points of view of the people themselves.

**Hania Sholkamy**

Measuring well-being through health is a big fallacy. It is a concept that is there and not there at the same time. We can start with the parameters and then ask questions about well-being from there. Well-being might be constant but who and what constitute it may change over time. This is why we will take a narrative life cycle approach in our research. Using statistical parameters will be useful but we will need to supplement this with narratives from individuals and families.

**Annelies Moors**

Regarding the point of the male breadwinner. Is it crucial in family law and social welfare systems?

**Hania Sholkamy**

I would prefer to call it the "ideal" of the male breadwinner. It is a starting point where we can look at the differences between the ideals and practices that are actually going on in the society.

**Mona Khalaf**

If we look at Gary Becker's book he makes it obvious that the concept of the male breadwinner started after the industrial revolution.

**Annelies Moors**

The concept of the male breadwinner has been a long standing question in family law. So when did it become a practice, and how did it change historically? In the question of the control of assets, there are different models on how and if women control their own assets. It is assumed that it is better for women to control their own assets rather than have the family control the assets.

**Suad Joseph**

The assumption that women contribute in household finances implies that they have a choice. Women don't always feel that they have a choice to contribute their assets.

**Ray Jureidini**

Some psychological studies say that there is always a victim in the family at whose expense the rest of the family prospers. Also, in the definition of employment and unemployment we should not keep to the standard definition of the ILO because they are meaningless definitions. For example, a person working one hour a day is considered to be employed. We need a conceptual definition of employment and unemployment.

**Mona Khalaf**

I do not think we should overlook international standards but we could take them and show how they do or do not apply.

**Hania Sholkamy**

We did not classify employed and unemployed but we will develop descriptive categories for example, who works between 1-5 hours etc.

**Barbara Ibrahim**

I suggest we collect data as detailed as possible and then be selective in our analysis.

**Mishka Mourani**

It would be interesting to look at the satisfaction of women who were working before marriage and then left work to raise a family because of social expectations.

**Hania Sholkamy**

Our life cycle approach will catch this. We will also use a life course approach that looks at how decisions that are made one point in time, affect later decisions.

**Penny Johnson**

Can there be such a thing as a family collective well-being or is it the sum of individual well-being?

**Suad Joseph**

Who gets to be the voice of family well-being? Whose well-being is necessary for the family to be successful? If there are miserable individuals in the family how do you decide if the family is in a state of well-being? What counts as misery? Whose misery counts to dislodge family well-being? There is some misery that is normative, for example teenagers. Who sets the parameters? These questions will be good to problematize.

**Penny Johnson**

We should look at the degree of misery that affects the functionality of the family.

**Mishka Mourani**

At times there is discrimination in the family with regards to boys and girls. If there is a family with girls only then girls are encouraged to get a good education and career. If the family has a boys as well as girls, then they could concentrate on the boys at the expense of the girls because they are seen as the future breadwinners and will take care of their sisters.

**Mona Khalaf**

This is where economics comes in, and if the family has the finances to send both the boys and girls to school.

**Mishka Mourani**

It is expected that the boys become the breadwinners and not the girls.

**Zeina Zaatari**

There is also the fact that girls can choose any career, unlike boys, because they do not have to become breadwinners.

**Barbara Ibrahim**

In Egypt, girls are encouraged to remain in school so as to get respectable jobs because boys can always get blue-collar jobs.

**Hania Sholkamy**

One parameter that leads to the breakdown of the family is the inability of the wife to produce a son. Women who cannot keep on trying to have a boy will suffer in the end.

**Martina Rieker**

Well-being is a confusing concept. There seems to be a certain political moment where the issue of well-being becomes important for example, with professional women. But what about the other classes, and what about the parameters for these different classes? Why does this question emerge in a certain political moment? Does well-being presume decisions and needs founded in certain Nation-State political projects? Who authors the question of whether there is well-being and puts this in the concept of political projects? These are important questions and need to be kept in mind.

**Hania Sholkamy**

I agree we need to historicize the question of well-being.

**Suad Joseph**

We have normalized the idea that individuals have to be happy and abnormalized the unhappy person, yet misery has probably been the norm, historically. If you look at our language you will notice that we command people to “have a good day”, “have fun”, as if these were normative occurrences. So the concept that normal is “happy” should be historicized and questioned not presumed.

## Concepts

1. Social, Economy, Religion, Culture, Politics
  - a. History
  - b. Modernity
  - c. Nation-State
    - (i) Identification Categories - Ethnicity/regionalism
    - (ii) Public/Private
2. a. Language and Arabic terms
  - b. Discourses
    - (i) Sites - media
    - (ii) New Sites - internet, chatting
3. Family
  - a. Kinship
  - b. Household
  - c. Transnational mothering
  - d. Fictive and idiomatic kin
  - e. Youth
    - (i) age
    - (ii) gender
    - (iii) valorization
    - (iv) "Shabab"
  - f. Public/Private
4. Power/Agency
  - a. Patriarchy
  - b. Patriarchal bargain
  - c. Hierarchy
  - d. Power/empowerment
  - e. Resistance/accommodation

## **Preparation for AFWG Volume I**

### **Reports of Research Project Groups next actions**

#### **1. Well-being Research Project Group**

We agreed on changes to be made to the concept paper that we have already produced.

Between April and December we will:

1. Meet with the Palestinian contact, that Penny Johnson will help us find, so as to bring in a fuller Palestinian context to our research.
2. Transform our existing concept paper into a chapter for the book.
3. Refine our methodology to operationalize our research project beginning January 2004.

Each one of us will be responsible for the research in their own country, but each one will also be responsible for a certain component across the project.

Well-being - Hania Sholkamy

Economic aspects - Mona Khalaf

Policy implications - Naila Sabra

Gender component and Palestinian dynamics - Palestinian member

We may have to train interviewers. We want to start operationalizing the research by January 2004.

#### **Methodologies**

1. Develop a macro statistical picture within a certain time frame
2. Family narratives - around 30 families over a 1 year period in each of our research sites  
Lebanon, Egypt, and Palestine.

#### **2. Border Crossings Research Project Group**

We went over our proposal, expanded and reorganized it, and divided up the work for revisions. We wanted to ask your suggestions on how to represent our different research projects in the theory section.

In the methods section, we will explain the sample we will use, the sample size, and the methods of research each one of us will use in their site.

We will then match the budget with the methods.

#### **Suad Joseph**

I suggest you add your five research topics in the theoretical section, and explain your commonalities.

#### **Annelies Moors**

I think you need to add more general theoretical issues to your concept paper.

### **3. Public Discourse Research Project Group**

We have divided up the work for the concept paper into three parts.

1. Why we want to focus on public discourse - Martina Rieker and Annelies Moors

We will look at the construction of the social and how the family is related to the state and nation building. The discourses that we will be looking at are;

- a. Discourses in the public sphere
- b. Discourses relating to public discourse and lived realities
- c. Discourses relating to the public/private

2. Why we are using the sites of law, media, and education - Hoda Elsadda, Penny Johnson

We will look at these three sites in three time frames

- a. Colonial Period
- b. Nation-State
- c. Present time

We will look at how the family is represented in law, education, and the media.

3. Why we are taking a focus on youth? - Suad Joseph, Barbara Ibrahim, Zeina Zaatari

We will look at:

- a. Gendered youth
- b. Masculinities/femininities
- c. Arab terminology
- d. Problematize the concept of youth
- e. Youth valorization

By May we will have drafts for these three sections.

## **Publications**

What do we want to produce by the end of the year?

1. Webpage - make some things on the webpage have public access.

We can make the bibliography available for public access. We should include links to the online sources.

2. Public Forum/workshop/Panel at conference
3. Publication - Special issue of Journal or collected volume

We can produce a book by the end of the year with the work we have done until now.

### **AFWG Volume I: Table of Contents of Publication**

1. Concept Paper - Suad Joseph and Martina Rieker
  - a. History of AFWG
  - b. Large overview of the project
  - c. Thematic continuities, concepts, approaches, paradigms, and methods that run through all the research project groups.
  - d. Explain the choice of our three country sites for research
2. Literature reviews that are country specific
  - a. Lebanon - Zeina Zaatari
  - b. Palestine - Lamis Abu Nahleh, Penny Johnson, Annelies Moors [Consultant]
  - c. Egypt - Hoda Elsadda, Rania Salem, Sherine Hafez
3. Project papers
  - a. Public Discourse - All members
  - b. Border Crossings - Nadine Naber, Annelies Moors [Consultant]
  - c. Well-being - Hania Sholkamy, Mona Khalaf, Barbara Ibrahim [Consultant]
4. Critical analysis of existing data sets - Martina Rieker, Barbara Ibrahim, [Penny Johnson, Hania Sholkamy, Ray Jureidini, Mona Khalaf, Mishka Mourani]
5. Bibliography - Naila Sabra, Nahla Zarroug

## University Press to Use

### Syracuse University Press

1. Keep copyrights with AFWG
2. Royalties to be put back into AFWG research fund
3. Do paperback as well
4. Translation into Arabic
5. Multiple copies for each AFWG member
6. Low turnaround time for publication

### **Fund-raising**

- |  |                                 |
|--|---------------------------------|
| 1. IDRC III                                      |                                 |
| 2. Ford Foundation                               | - Ibrahim Elnur, Hania Sholkamy |
| 3. Packard Foundation                            | - Barbara Ibrahim, Suad Joseph  |
| 4. Hewlett                                       | - Barbara Ibrahim, Suad Joseph  |
| 5. Arab Fund for Social and Economic Development | - Ibrahim Elnur                 |
| 6. Arab Gulf Fund                                | - Jihad Makhoul, Mona Khalaf    |
| 7. Mellon  | - Barbara Ibrahim               |
| 8. Rockefeller                                   |                                 |
| 9. Mac Arthur                                    | - Nadine Naber                  |
| 10. Sephis                                       | - Annelies Moors                |
| 11. Novib  | - Penny Johnson                 |
| 12. Volkswagen                                   |                                 |
| 13. SIDA   | - Penny Johnson                 |
| 14. UN University in Tokyo                       | - Naila Sabra                   |
| 15. Konrad Adenauer Foundation                   | - Annelies Moors                |

## **AFWG Timetable**

<b>April 1, 2003</b>	Border Crossings and Well-being Research Project Groups to send revised proposals to Dr. Suad Joseph
<b>April 15, 2003</b>	Dr. Suad Joseph to send revised AFWG proposal to Ford Foundation
<b>June 1, 2003</b>	Public Discourse papers to be sent to all members of the Public Discourse Research Project Group
<b>June 5, 2003</b>	All Rough draft chapters for book to be sent to all Core Group members
<b>June 9-11, 2003</b>	Writing Workshop at Stella Di Mare - Ain Soukhna
<b>June 12, 2003</b>	Data Survey group meeting - Stella Di Mare - Ain Soukhna
<b>September 20-23, 2003</b>	Blocked for possible AFWG Core Group Meeting
<b>December 1, 2003</b>	Final drafts of chapters for book

## AFWG Budget

1. Translation into Arabic - Ford Foundation, CIDA

2. Research Project Groups:

a. Well-being Research Project Group

- Research assistant \$2500
- Meeting before June \$1500
- Photocopying \$500

Total: \$4500

**Round-up to \$5000**

b. Border Crossings

- Research Assistant - California & Cairo

**\$5000**

c. Public Discourse

**\$5000**

d. Data Survey

- Research Assistant [4 months, half time]  
\$3000

**Round-up to \$5000**

e. Literature Reviews

- Lebanon, Zeina Zaatari **\$1000**
- Egypt, Rania Salem & Sherine Hafez **\$1000**
- Palestine, Penny Johnson & Lamis Abu Nahleh **\$1000**

Editing Volume

**\$2000-3000**

**Total Budget: \$26,000**